Mott Transition, Antiferromagnetism, and d-wave Superconductivity in Two-Dimensional Organic Conductors

B. Kyung and A. -M. S. Tremblay

Département de physique and Regroupement québécois sur les matériaux de pointe,
Université de Sherbrooke, Sherbrooke, Québec, J1K 2R1, Canada

(Dated: February 5, 2008)

We study the Mott transition, antiferromagnetism and superconductivity in layered organic conductors using Cellular Dynamical Mean Field Theory for the frustrated Hubbard model. A d-wave superconducting phase appears between an antiferromagnetic insulator and a metal for \( t'/t = 0.3 - 0.7 \), or between a nonmagnetic Mott insulator (spin liquid) and a metal for \( t'/t \geq 0.8 \), in agreement with experiments on layered organic conductors including \( \kappa\text{-}(ET)_2\text{Cu}_2(\text{CN})_3 \). These phases are separated by a strong first order transition. The phase diagram gives much insight into the mechanism for d-wave superconductivity. Two predictions are made.

PACS numbers: 71.10.Fd, 71.27.+a, 71.30.+h, 71.10.-w

Strong electronic correlations lead to fascinating phenomena such as high-temperature superconductivity and metal-insulator (Mott) transitions. In that context, layered organic conductors \( \kappa\text{-}(BEDT-TTF)_2X \) (X denotes an anion) play a special role. They share many features with high-temperature superconductors (HTSC) \[1, 2\], such as the existence of d-wave superconductivity and antiferromagnetism. But they have an even richer phase diagram since they also display a Mott transition and possibly a \( T = 0 \) spin liquid phase. Microscopically, they are described by the two-dimensional one-band Hubbard model, just as HTSC, albeit on an anisotropic triangular lattice instead of a square lattice.\[3\] The various phases of HTSC are explored essentially by changing doping. The phases of organic conductors on the other hand are controlled by pressure and by frustration, two variables over which one has very little control in the HTSC. In this paper, we will see that we can capitalize on recent theoretical progress on the theory of HTSC to understand organic conductors. In return, the agreement that we find between theory and experiment for these compounds leads to much insight into the origin of d-wave superconductivity in the one-band Hubbard model in general.

Experimentally, metallic, paramagnetic insulating (spin liquid SL), antiferromagnetic (AF), and unconventional superconducting (SC) phases are all found, for example, in the pressure vs temperature phase diagram of \( X=\text{Cu}[\text{N(CN)}_2]\text{Cl}_2 \).\[4\] The broken-symmetry states overlap through a first order boundary that merges with the first order line of the Mott metal-insulator transition in the normal state. Various experiments suggest that the superconductivity has line nodes\[5\] that are strongly suggestive of d-wave character. Changing the anion modifies the frustration in the lattice. The anion \( (X=\text{Cu}_2(\text{CN})_3) \)\[6\], which corresponds to large frustration, has attracted considerable attention because of the transition from d-wave SC to a possible SL state where no magnetic long-range order was found down to a very low temperature (23mK), in contrast to other layered organic materials.

The intriguing behaviors observed in layered organic conductors have prompted theoretical studies using various analytical and numerical methods. The existence of magnetic, metallic and spin liquid phases, but not d-wave superconductivity, has been explored using a path-integral renormalization group method for the frustrated Hubbard model by Morita et al.\[7\]. Signatures of a finite temperature Mott critical point in agreement with experimental studies of \( \kappa \)-organics and with single site DMFT have been found with Cellular Dynamical Mean Field Theory (CDMFT)\[8\] in conjunction with a quantum Monte Carlo (QMC) method, by Parcollet et al.\[9\]. At \( T=0 \), using a variational Monte Carlo (VMC) method, Liu et al.\[10\] showed an unconventional SC ground state, sandwiched between a conventional metal at weak coupling and a spin liquid at large coupling, but antiferromagnetism was not considered. Similarly, with a U(1) gauge theory in the slave-rotor representation, Lee et al.\[11\] found a first order transition from a superconductor to a spin liquid and Powell et al.\[12\] showed a first order transition from a Mott insulator to a d-wave superconductor using a Gutzwiller projection method for the Hubbard-Heisenberg model. Gan et al.\[13\] found a Gossamer superconductor at small U and an AF insulator at large U, separated by a first order transition. Only the variational study of Watamabe et al.\[14\] considered the possibility of all phases, metallic, d-wave SC, AF and SL. However, they did not find AF where it is observed experimentally.

The layered organic conductors are described by the frustrated two-dimensional Hubbard model\[15\]

\[
H = \sum_{\langle ij \rangle, \sigma} t_{ij} c_{i\sigma}^\dagger c_{j\sigma} + U \sum_i n_{i\uparrow} n_{i\downarrow} - \mu \sum_{\sigma} c_{i\sigma}^\dagger c_{i\sigma}, \tag{1}
\]

where \( c_{i\sigma}^\dagger (c_{i\sigma}) \) are creation (annihilation) operators for electrons of spin \( \sigma \), \( n_{i\sigma} = c_{i\sigma}^\dagger c_{i\sigma} \) is the density of \( \sigma \) spin electrons. The hopping amplitude \( t_{ij} \) determines the anisotropic bare dispersion \( \varepsilon_k = -2t(\cos k_x + \cos k_y) - 2t' \cos(k_x + k_y) - 2t' \cos(k_x - k_y). \) (The HTSC have an additional \( 2t' \cos(k_x - k_y) \) in their dispersion). \( U \) is the on-site repulsive interaction and \( \mu \) is the chemical potential con-
half-filling (with $t'/t = 0.5 - 1.1$).

Our results are summarized by the $U/t$ vs $t'/t$ phase diagram in Fig. 1. A $d$-wave SC phase appears in a relatively narrow region between metallic (M) and AF phases, or between metallic (M) and spin liquid (SL). The phase transition lines are all first order, except for the SC-metal transition that is also first order but eventually turns second order (dashed line) for sufficiently large $t'/t$ (see caveat 17). Three phases, M-AF-SC, meet at the triple point near $t'/t = 0.25$ and $U/t = 2.75$, satisfying the Gibbs phase rule. There is a jump for all order parameters so that this point does not exhibit SO(5) symmetry 17. The SL phase (paramagnetic Mott insulator) appears only for large $t'/t$ (large frustration) and large $U/t$ (strong correlations). If we do not allow for broken symmetry, we obtain a normal state that has a first order Mott metal-insulator transition that coincides with the first order line that separates SC from either AF or SL. That first order line however ends at a critical point for $t'/t$ close to 0.5.

**Predictions**: Based on the calculated phase diagram, we predict a class of new materials (with $t'/t \sim 0.8 - 0.9$) which would undergo a series of phase transitions from an AF insulator to a paramagnetic Mott insulator (spin liquid) to a $d$-wave superconductor to a metal with increasing pressure. Also, we predict that if AF and SC are destroyed with an external symmetry-restoring perturbation (magnetic field), the first-order transition that separates them should remain as a first-order Mott metal-insulator transition. In the following, we describe the method and results that lead to the above phase diagram. We then discuss the remarkable agreement with existing experiments.

**Method**: We use Cellular Dynamical Mean-Field Theory (CDMFT) 8, a cluster approach that allows one to extend Dynamical Mean Field Theory (DMFT) to include momentum dependence of the self-energy. CDMFT has been benchmarked and is accurate even in one dimension 9. The infinite lattice is tiled with identical clusters of size $N_c$, and the degrees of freedom in the cluster are treated exactly while the remaining ones are replaced by a bath of non-interacting electrons that is determined self-consistently. To solve the quantum cluster embedded in an effective SC medium, we consider a cluster-bath Hamiltonian of the form 20, 21

$$H = \sum_{(\mu\nu),\sigma} t_{\mu\nu} c_{\mu\sigma}^\dagger c_{\nu\sigma} + U \sum_{\mu} n_{\mu\uparrow} n_{\mu\downarrow} + \sum_{m,\sigma} \epsilon_m^{\sigma} a_{m\sigma}^\dagger a_{m\sigma} + \sum_{m,\mu,\sigma} V_{m\mu\sigma} (a_{m\sigma}^\dagger c_{\mu\sigma} + \text{H.c.}) + \sum_{m,n,\alpha} \Delta_{mn} (a_{m\alpha}^\dagger a_{n\alpha}^\dagger + \text{H.c.}).$$

Here the indices $\mu, \nu = 1, \ldots, N_c$ label sites within the cluster, and $c_{\mu\sigma}$ and $a_{m\alpha}$ annihilate electrons on the cluster and the bath, respectively. $t_{\mu\nu}$ is the hopping matrix within the cluster, and $\epsilon_m^{\sigma}$ and $V_{m\mu\sigma}$ carry a spin variable $\sigma$ explicitly. In the present study we used $N_c = 4$ sites for the cluster and $N_b = 8$ sites for the bath with $m = 1, \ldots, 4$ and $\alpha = 1, 2$. In the normal state, because of symmetry, there are 8 independent parameters, while there are 18 when AF and SC are allowed to compete. To deal with superconductivity, the Nambu spinor representation is used for the cluster operators so that the Weiss field, the cluster Green’s function and self-energy constructed from these operators are $8 \times 8$ matrices. The exact diagonalization method 22 is used to solve the cluster-bath Hamiltonian Eq. 2 at zero temperature, which has the advantage of computing dynamical quantities directly in real frequency and of treating the large $U$ regime without difficulty. Although the present study focuses on a $2 \times 2$ cluster with additional 8 bath sites, we expect our results to be robust with respect to an increase in the cluster size. This was verified by our recent low (but finite) temperature CDMFT+QMC calculations 23 where at intermediate to strong coupling a $2 \times 2$ cluster accounts for more than 95% of the correlation effect of the infinite size cluster in the single-particle spectrum. Recent Variational Cluster Perturbation Theory (VCPT) calculations 24 for the same Hamiltonian also confirmed that results on a $2 \times 2$ cluster are quantitatively similar to those on larger clusters.

**Normal state Mott transition**: We first present the evidence of a first order line of metal-to-insulator transition in the normal state. That line also turns out to coincide..
with the phase boundary between AF and SC phases for
$t'/t > 0.5$. The present results obtained in the normal
state at $T = 0$ would be relevant when the temperature
is slightly higher than $T_c$ and $T_N$, or in regions where
broken-symmetries are destroyed at zero temperature by
an external symmetry restoring perturbation. The first
plot in Fig. 2(a) shows the double occupancy $(n_\uparrow n_\downarrow)$ (circles) for two different $t'/t$. For $t'/t = 0.7$ it jumps dis-
continuously to a lower value near $U/t = 7.0$, while for
$t'/t = 1.0$ the first order transition occurs near $U/t = 8.5$
which is comparable to the value obtained by Parcollet
et al. \cite{9} in CDMFT+QMC and Watanabe et al. \cite{12}
in VMC. To show hysteresis associated with a first order
transition, we also calculated the double occupancy (di-
monds in Fig. 2(a)) with the insulating solution as an
initial guess. In this case the first order transition occurs
for a value of $U$ that is typically smaller by $0.5 - 0.75t$.
A very similar hysteresis is found for all the first order
transitions shown in this paper, but for the rest of the
paper we show results obtained only with the metallic
solution as an initial guess. The critical $U_c$ shown in
Fig. 2(b) decreases monotonically with decreasing $t'/t$
until the first order transition disappears near $t'/t = 0.5$, 
close to $t'/t \leq 0.4$ found by Watanabe et al. \cite{12}.

While various studies \cite{9, 12, 11, 10, 14, 13} suggested the existence of a first order transition for the frustrated
Hubbard model in static quantities, here we present the
strongest evidence of a first order transition from a metal to an insulator by presenting dynamical quantities $A(\vec{k}, \omega)$. For $U/t = 6.9$ slightly smaller than critical $U_c/t$ for
$t'/t = 0.7$, the spectral function has a sharp quasipart-
cle peak near the Fermi wave vectors (Fig. 3(a)) consist-
tent with a Fermi liquid picture. It is more evident from
the fact that $A(\vec{k}, \omega)$ becomes sharper as $\vec{k}$ approaches
the Fermi surface. When $U/t$ is increased only by a tiny
fraction (less than 1%), the first order metal-to-insulator
transition manifests itself as the massive reshuffling of
the spectral weight. An insulating gap is present in the
whole Brillouin zone, reminiscent of the spectral function
in the two-dimensional Hubbard model at half-filling \cite{20}.

\begin{figure}[h]
\centering
\includegraphics[width=0.8\textwidth]{fig2.png}
\caption{(a) double occupancy $D = \langle n_\uparrow n_\downarrow \rangle$ as a function of $U/t$ for $t'/t = 0.7$ (solid curve) and $t'/t = 1.0$ (dashed curve),
(b) critical $U_c/t$ as a function of $t'/t$ in the normal state. The diamond symbols in (a) are obtained with the insulating
solution as an initial guess.}
\end{figure}

\begin{figure}[h]
\centering
\includegraphics[width=0.8\textwidth]{fig3.png}
\caption{Spectral function $A(\vec{k}, \omega)$ along some symmetry di-
rections for (a) $U/t = 6.9$ and (b) $U/t = 6.95$ for $t'/t = 0.7$ in
the normal state.}
\end{figure}

\begin{figure}[h]
\centering
\includegraphics[width=0.8\textwidth]{fig4.png}
\caption{(Color online) Order parameters of the frustrated
two-dimensional Hubbard model as a function of pressure
(modeled as $t/U$) at zero temperature for (a) $t'/t = 0.7$ and
(b) $t'/t = 1.0$. $d$ (circles) and $m$ (diamonds) denote the $d$-wave
SC and AF order parameters, respectively. $m$ is multiplied
by 0.1 to fit in the plots.}
\end{figure}

\section*{Broken symmetry states:} Next we study the existence
of broken symmetry states in the frustrated model and
the role of the first order transition in those states.
Because of possible coexistence of AF and SC phases,
the two order parameters are treated on equal footing.
For a SC phase two symmetries are considered $d_{x^2-y^2}$
and $d_{xy}$. For all the parameters studied $d_{x^2-y^2}$ sym-
metry always dominates over $d_{xy}$ (see caveat \cite{22}).
For $t'/t = 0.7$ (Fig. 4(a)) AF and SC phases abruptly ter-
iminate near $U/t = 7$, the same $U_c$ as in the normal state
where a metal-to-insulator transition occurs. We have
not found evidence of homogeneous states with non-zero
AF and SC order parameters simultaneously, in contrast
to the case of the square lattice $t - t' - U$ model for
HTSC at finite doping, where AF can have some itinerant
character \cite{20, 27}. With enough frustration, $t'/t = 1.0$
(Fig. 4(b)) a direct first order transition from a param-
anomalous Mott insulator to a superconductor occurs near $U/t = 8.25$ in agreement with other recent theoretical works. That paramagnetic Mott insulator is commonly referred to as a spin liquid. This result is also in agreement with the study of the $J - J'$ Heisenberg model in which the Néel order persists up to $J'/J = 0.6 - 0.7$ ($t'/t = 0.77 - 0.84$). Nevertheless, we have to leave open the possibility that magnetically ordered phases different from AF are more stable than the SL.

Contact with experiment: In first approximation, the effect of pressure is to decrease the ratio $U/t$, even though $t'/t$ should also change slightly. We now demonstrate that our phase diagram Fig. 1 accounts for a surprisingly large number of experimental results if we assume that pressure only decreases the $U/t$ ratio at fixed $t'/t$, the various compounds being associated to a given $t'/t$. For $t'/t = 0.7$ (Fig. 1(a)) which is relevant to $\kappa$-(ET)$_2$Cu$_2$(CN)$_3$Cl, Fig. 1 shows that, as observed experimentally: (a) as pressure increases, $(U/t)$ decreases, one crosses a first order transition between AF and SC phase (b) the maximum SC order parameter occurs at the phase boundary (c) in the normal state there is a first order Mott-insulator transition, at essentially the same $t/U$ ratio. The d-wave SC in our phase diagram however exists in a relatively small region of $t/U$ in Fig. 1. In the experimental phase diagram the SC region extends far beyond the AF+SC phase boundary in the pressure vs temperature plane, but in the absence of a precise scale connecting pressure and $t/U$ this cannot be taken as a real disagreement. For $t'/t = 1.0$, close to the value for $\kappa$-(ET)$_2$Cu$_2$(CN)$_3$, the AF phase is not stabilized even for large $U/t$ due to too strong frustration and the transition is between a SL and SC, (Fig. 1(b)) consistent with recent experiments by Shimizu et al.

Another clear overall trend in our results is that the maximum value of the SC order parameter decreases monotonically with $t'/t$ (0.0276, 0.0258, 0.0228, 0.0186, 0.0145 for $t'/t = 0.6, 0.7, 0.8, 0.9, 1.0$). This trend is remarkably consistent with experiments where compounds with weaker frustration (smaller $t'/t$) have higher $T_c$, for instance, $T_c = 11.6, 10.4, 3.9K$ for $X$=Cu[N(CN)$_2$]Br($t'/t = 0.68$), $X$=Cu(NCS)$_2$(($t'/t = 0.84$), $X$=Cu$_2$(CN)$_3$(($t'/t = 1.06$), respectively.

Mechanism for d-wave superconductivity: Along the AF-SC and SL-SC phase transition lines, the maximum value of the SC order parameter increases with $U$ until $U \sim 6t$ and then it starts to decrease, as does the value of $J = 4t^2/U$. In previous studies of HTSC, the maximum value of the doping dependent SC order parameter was found to scale similarly with interaction strength. In the organics, at fixed $t'/t$ the SC order parameter always increases with increasing $U$ until it drops to zero at the phase boundary. The SC region is broadest near $t'/t = 0.5$ and becomes narrower for both smaller and larger $t'/t$, vanishing near $t'/t = 0.25$ and $t'/t = 1.2$, respectively. If there is not enough frustration in the system, as in the case of near perfect nesting at small $t'/t$, AF long-range order is stabilized, suppressing the SC phase. Increasing frustration then helps d-wave SC, as suggested for the cuprates. However, too strong frustration at large $t'/t$ suppresses even short-range singlet correlations on which pairing correlations may build up so that SC disappears again for $t'/t \geq 1.2$. Note that the ratio of interaction strength $U$ to hopping integral $t$ is of the same order in the organics and in HTSC but that the energy scale set by the hopping integrals is an order of magnitude smaller in these compounds than in the HTSC.

In conclusion, we have obtained the phase diagram for layered organic conductors using CDMFT. The calculated sequence of phases and the nature of the transitions between them are consistent with observations in that class of compounds. In addition, the observed maximum value of $T_c$ near the Mott transition is consistent with the calculated maximum SC order parameter. This allows us to predict a new class of materials. In conjunction with results for HTSC, the present results also allow us to understand more deeply the role of exchange interactions and of frustration for d-wave superconductivity.

We thank C. Bourbonnais, M. Poirier, P. Sahebsara, D. Sénéchal, and M. Tanatar for useful discussions, and J. Schmalian for pointing out several recent references on organic conductors. Computations were performed on the Elix2 Beowulf cluster and on the Dell cluster of the RQCHP. The present work was supported by NSERC (Canada), FQRNT (Québec), CFI (Canada), CIAR, the Tier I Canada Research Chair Program (A.-M.S.T.).

[3] We adopt the one-band model since in weak coupling calculations, that should be particularly sensitive to band structure effects, the phase diagram is similar for the one-band and the two-band model: see Kazuhiko Kuroki, cond-mat/0601060.
[14] T. Watanabe et al., cond-mat/0602098
[16] Where the transition changes from 1st to 2nd order there might be some extra more-exotic phases that we are not able to resolve on a 2X2 cluster.
[21] S.S. Kancharla et al., cond-mat/0508205
[25] The possibility of \( d_{x^2-y^2} + id_{xy} \) gap symmetry cannot be ruled out.
[27] M. Capone et al., cond-mat/0603227